Ethiopian Elderly and Pensioners National Association (EEPNA)

Situation of Older People due to Urban Induced Development Relocation and Settlements in Addis Ababa

July 2018

Addis Ababa

SITUATION OF OLDER PEOPLE DUE TO URBAN INDUCED DEVELOPMENT RELOCATION AND SETTLMENT IN ADDDIS ABABA

Acronyms and Definition for Related Terms

AMG	Apex Monitoring Group
BoFED	Bureau of Finance and Economy Development
CBOs	Community Based Organisation
ChSA	Charities and Societies Agency
CSA	Central Statistical Authority
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
CSP/R	Charities and Societies Proclamation/ Regulation
CSRP	Civil Service Reform Program
GO	Government
GTP-II	Growth and Transformation Plan-II
HIV/AIDS	Human Immune Virus/Acquired Immune Disease Syndrome
HPG	Humanitarian Policy Group
IDOP	International Day of Older Persons
MoE	Ministry of Education
MoFEd	Ministry of Finance and Economy Development
MoH	Ministry of Health
MoWCA	Ministry of Women and Child Affair
MSC	Most Significant Change
NGO	Non-Government Organization
OCM	Older Citizens Monitoring
OPMG	Older People Monitoring Groups
PLWHA	People Living with HIV/AIDS
PSNP	Productive Safety Net Program
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
Definition of Related Terms to Displacement	
Displacement (development-induced displacement)	According to this assessment the concept of Urban Displacement is defined as "relocation and resettlement of certain households, in most cases the powerless low income people like older people".
Urban Renewal	The process of demolishing and reconstructing central urban slums for economic and urban image aims thereby creating better environment. It implies demolishing and relocating the previous settlers to a different area outside their neighborhoods.
Urban Redevelopment	The process of demolishing and reconstructing central urban slums for economic, social and scenic aims. It could be understood as a mild renewal where the objectives and the process give focus and attention to the existing settlers by accommodating them as far as possible.
Slums	Urban residential areas environmentally unfit for human living owing to the poor quality and/or absence of basic physical, economic, and social amenities. According to urban poor in the Ethiopian urban context, slums neighborhoods are strongly mixed where the poor, the average and the well-to-do live together.
Urban Upgrading:	Intervention in slum areas by the introduction of economic, social, and physical services and infrastructure and the improvement of the housing physical conditions thereby creating better environment.
Informal Settlements	Settlements who have been there for years and therefore have developed a certain level of acceptable claims and rights, but still without full legal rights to the land and the housing units. The length of occupancy period to quality for being an informal settlement depends on the local policies

	and regulations.
Relocation:	The process of transforming the living and working area of citizens from their established neighborhoods to new areas.
Resettlement:	The process of re-housing urban citizens that have been relocated either on-site or off-site.
Urban Levels:	Ethiopian urban centers have been classified in to five levels: Small Towns (2,000-20,000 population), Medium Towns (20,001-50,000 population), Large Towns (50,001-100,000 population), Cities (100,001-1,000,000 population) and Metropolis (over a million population).
Eviction:	The forceful evacuation of slum dwellers from their original neighborhoods without their consent.
Expropriation:	Taking over privately occupied land and housing for the purpose of reutilizing the area in a more productive way that benefits the public.
Transitional Settlement:	A temporary settlement built for transitional period (depending upon the local context) to shelter displaced slum dwellers until a formally registered accommodation is arranged

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

EXCUTIVE SUMMARY

Objective and Method of the Assessment

The main objective of this research is to identify impact of urban displacement on older people based on **Literature Review and Case Stories of Older People** and to generate **Policy Recommendations** for lobby and advocacy purpose.

The main methodologies used for this older people displacement analysis are review of secondary documents (desk research) and Case Story Interview: review of available documents, reports of previous studies, government policies, legislation, and guideline applicable to CSOs working on elderly and conducting case interviews.

According to this assessment the concept of Urban Displacement is defined as "relocation and resettlement of certain households, in most cases the powerless low income people like older people due to urban upgrading/urban renewal. This assessment does not include older people displacement (refuges) due to natural disaster or conflict.

Assessment Findings and Recommendations

This assessment explores the process of older people residential relocation due to inner-city slum renewal and upgrading program of Addis Ababa. Drawing on qualitative research methods involving document review and case stories interviews of nine older people relocated households, it examines the nature of people's involvement in urban renewal/upgrading and how it affects their lives due to situation of older people due to the relocation and settlement situation. The assessment finding argues that the process of planning and implementation of relocation was mostly top-down, and also does not involve the perspectives, needs, and livelihood strategies of those affected poor citizen. As a result, the finding gives advices for the city administration, primary encourage the real participation of displaced people and secondly the needs to work closely with NGOs, the private sector, and community-based organizations in order to meet the housing needs of the relocated households.

Development experts, politicians and the international community have strongly criticized urban renewals for their huge social and economic costs. These schemes were found anti-poor designed mainly to chase out the urban poor from inner city areas. As the negative consequences for the bulldozing approach became more and more politicized, planners and policy makers retreated and stared to look for approaches and strategies which perceive urban renewal as a process of integrated changes in spatial, economic, and social dimensions of slum areas (McCallum and Steingerg, 1987).

To sum-up, the relocation programs almost in all cases did not benefited the displaced communities as advocated (Arimah 2010). The merits are better quality of houses and better open space for children to play. On the other hand, the process of relocating people from the inner city to new resettlement sites in the outskirts have disrupted the

relocates' business ties with customers, broken their informal networks of survival, caused loss of locational advantage and jobs and incurred high transport costs. The overwhelming majority of relocates reported significant income decline. Many displaced households have encountered problems related to water, sanitation, education, and healthcare. The rent or the payment is not affordable; loss of social solidarity, high cost of transport and services. Farmers, who lost their land to investors and new resettles complained about low compensation and lack of other economic options to make a living.

Finally; the document review result and the case story assessment **recommends** the following strategic directions during relocation and settlement programs that affect the lives of older and other destitute people:

❖ Production of affordable development plans that address the urban poor could be achieved by closely working with the community based on what they can afford rather than imposing arbitrary official decisions of standards and procedures;

❖ Gender issues are important; and older women need and demand to be adequately represented;

❖ Upgrading programs are most effective when implanted at the community level through a broad based participation of municipal authorities, community based organizations NGO's, and UN agencies such as UNICEF and Habitat.

❖ Case study respondent suggested during displacement it is important to give support for those who have no or minimal income, whereas, some of them suggested that giving full and all round support, care and comfortable housing for weak aging people and older people living in a poor living condition.

❖ During relocation and settlement, elderly should enjoy a sound and fulfilling old aged life toward achieving a promising life through their physical, mental, emotional, social and spiritual development and wellbeing.

❖ Case study respondent also recommended that while giving displaced people new houses the comfort and safety for older people needs to be maintained, for instance avoiding stairs for older people and placing them on the ground floor is one of the thing suggested by almost all older people.

❖ Furthermore, some of them suggested that weaker old people not to be displaced from their areas and to be placed in their nearby constructed house projects. Few of some suggested to put the older people from the same area in to the same surroundings so that the social and communal relationship will not disrupted.

❖ Thus, urban redevelopment schemes must combine improved livelihood with both better shelter *and* socioeconomic opportunities and provisions of services and facilities.

❖ Many of the problems are manifestations of misguided planning and poor housing and urban development strategies. It appears that there are weak linkages between policy makers, planners, support institutions and the public at large.

❖ The eligibility criteria of meeting the minimum initial payments for condominium houses is vital for social groups like women; older and disabled poor people, therefore it important to revise/amend the affordability of the condominium units, through supporting/subsidizing mechanisms.

- ❖ One proposed change offers a strict formula for allocating the limited funds to low- and moderate-income housing and rehabilitation in more severely depressed areas.
- ❖ Addis Ababa city authority should work with local NGOs, CBOs, donors and residents to ensure that people's preferences are taken into account in resettlement plans. There is a growing recognition that resettlement projects should involve communities, CBOs, NGOs, the private sector, and other stakeholders.
- ❖ Given the inevitability of large-scale urban displacements in the future, Ethiopia needs to develop a resettlement policy with clear guidelines and procedures, and involve relevant stakeholders and partners in resettlement operations.
- ❖ It is important to support the reestablishment of project affected people as matter of right rather than as a humanitarian act of benevolence.
- ❖ The right to the city 'would basically consist of the right of all city dwellers to fully enjoy urban life with all of its services and advantages.
- ❖ The document review result and the case stories justify that there is no awareness concerning the policy devised by the government concerning elderly people right and the gaps urban displacement program for older people. Therefore; advocating for policy inclusion and awareness raising on policies are the duty and responsibility of organization working on older people.

1. SCOPE AND METDOLOGY OF URBAN DISPLACMENT ASSESSMENT

According to this assessment the concept of Urban Displacement is defined as "relocation and resettlement of certain households, in most cases the powerless low income people like older people due to urban upgrading/urban renewal. This assessment does not include older people displacement (refuges) due to natural disaster or conflict.

1.1. Purpose and Objective of the Assessment

Many findings indicate that older people are vulnerable to urban displacement as their needs and priorities are not considered during all this process. Displacement has many impacts on older people such as:
- Exclusion and discrimination;
- Erosion of family and traditional support systems;
- Access to information and documentation;
- Access to basic services, including shelter, food and nutrition, Livelihoods and recovery, and health.

The main objective of this research is to identify impact of urban displacement on older people based on **Literature Review and Case Stories of Older People** and to generate **Policy Recommendations** for lobby and advocacy purpose.

The recent findings from life experience of older people shows that for older people cities present physical, social and economic barriers that prevent them realizing their right to live in dignity and safety, or enjoying their surroundings. Hence the consultant expected to:
1) Develop different real case stories from older people themselves displaced due to urban relocation program, infrastructure development and expiation;
2) Review related national policies and strategies related to urban relocation or displacement and how vulnerable group issues are addressed. List any article mentioning the elderly needs and priority;
3) Develop policy recommendations and program interventions to address the gaps in policy and programming identified during this task. The following issues needs due attention:

1.2. Approach and Methodology of the Assessment

The main methodologies used for this older people displacement analysis are review of secondary documents (desk research) and Case Story Interview: review of available documents, reports of previous studies, government policies, legislation, and guideline applicable to CSOs working on elderly and conducting case interviews.

Case Story Areas and Targets: Purposive sampling was used to select older people case stories that were affected by development induced-displacement. The goal is to convey the views of older people with different characteristics and setting. The data collection techniques include observation and in-depth interviews of nine displaced

older people in three different areas of Addis Ababa. These displaced older women and men are interviewed on: previous and current family's situation, social values and economic changes, accessibility and inclusion, health and education opportunities and challenges, understanding and exercise of older people right etc.

Data Quality Assurance Issues on the Case Stories
- ✍ Two experienced enumerator (minute taker and interviewer) are deployed for the case story in the three areas Addis Ababa. The main consultant has design the questionnaire and facilitated the data collection process.
- ✍ The crewwhoare deployed for case story collection have received half day orientation on the prepared case story interview questionnaire and approaches of interviewing older persons before they deployment for actual field. Accordingly; three older men and six older women were successfully interviewed (see the summarized result on chapter four)

Data Management, Processing and Analysis
The data collected through qualitative interviews (case stories) have been analyzed and interpreted by using qualitative techniques. Content analysis, narrative summary analysis and triangulation techniques have been employed to analyze the secondary data with the primary data of the case stories.

Expected outputs/Deliverables
- ❖ Case stories design have been shared for the client before the interview;
- ❖ The draft report on "**Urban Induced Development Relocation and Settlement in Addis Ababa**" have been submitted and input from the client included;
- ❖ Delivered the final report **Older People Displacement Analysis** soft and printed copy for EEPNA.

1.3. Limitation of the Assessment

The findings of this study are not and could not be exhaustive because it is based on secondary document review results. The assessment also suffered from lack of primary data due to lack of sufficient finance, which possibly complement the existing result. Some of the data lack consistency due to data collection problems: purposefully selected few case stories in Addis Ababa cannot show all the features of urban displacement character and types of all urban areas of Ethiopia. Hence, the results of this assessment should be viewed in line with these limitations and it can only serve as a baseline for an in-depth study on elderly person's situation due to urban resettlement or displacement.

2. BACKGROUND NOTE ON OLDER PEOPLE SITUATION DUE TO URBAN DISPLACEMENT (Relocation and Resettlement)

Older people have special needs; they also have unique skills, experiences and roles within their families, communities and societies. Within the community, older people are seen as custodians of knowledge, and older men in particular play a key role in decision-making and mediating in disputes. Displacement can negatively affect the traditional roles of older people, leaving older people with less influence and power[1]. Particularly when displacement happened due to natural disaster and conflict older people's traditional power and influence diminish which means change of power, authority and role in the community as a result of displacement (older person refuge who reside in different location and society)[2].

2.1. International Lessons about Urban Displacement

Old age is the last stage of the life span in normal human development. The term old means the last stage in the life processes of an individual and it meant also a generation comprising a segment of the oldest or senior members of a population. There is no universally accepted age that is considered old among or within societies, because of inconsistencies as to what age a society may consider old and what members in that society may be considered old[3].

The proportion of the elderly living in independent or separate housing units is relatively high in developed countries. Likewise, in developing countries the overwhelming majority of living and care arrangements for older people are still intimately connected to living situations involving younger relatives; few live alone. In less developed countries like Latin America, Africa and Asia elderly people are concentrated in slums or squatter settlements characterized by substandard housing, inadequate services and lack of sanitation (UN, 1991).

In developed nations during in 1970s; urban renewal programs originally intended to clear out the slums and thereby induce the return of the middle class. Because of increasing resistance to such clearance and displacement, emphasis shifted to neighborhood revitalization. Due to aging problem, older people showed greater need for community services and aid if relocation is required[4].

Development experts, politicians and the international community have strongly criticized urban renewals for their huge social and economic costs. These schemes were found anti-poor designed mainly to chase out the urban poor from inner city areas. As

---

[1]Veronique Barbelet and Fiona Samuels, with Georgia Plank (2018): HPG Commissioned Report, the role and vulnerabilities of older people in drought in East Africa Progress, challenges and opportunities for a more inclusive humanitarian response

[2]Veronique Barbelet (July 2018): HPG Commissioned Report,Older People in Displacement Falling through the Cracks of Emergency Responses

[3]KibreAregawuyanMigbareSenayDirijit (KAMSD); An Assessment of the Situation of Elderly in Addis Ababa; January 2009

[4]Marc Levin (1980): Neighborhood Development and the Displacement of the Elderly

the negative consequences for the bulldozing approach became more and more politicized, planners and policy makers retreated and stared to look for approaches and strategies which perceive urban renewal as a process of integrated changes in spatial, economic, and social dimensions of slum areas (McCallum and Steingerg, 1987).

Indeed, implementation of such schemes was not done without an adverse effect to the urban poor. For instance in Delhi, as part of the massive program of forcible resettlement undertaken in the mid -1970s which affected the bulk of the residents of squatter settlements, low income families from the old city were also moved to newly developed sites several miles from the center. Consequently, families who suffered from loss of income owing to disruption of their employment opportunities later returned back to the inner city (UNCHS, 1984).

In Bangkok, small- scale resettlement schemes were carried out to accommodate slum dwellers displaced by the construction of new roads. In these schemes houses were provided at alternative sites at a very high rate of subsidy, but these were quickly sold off to middle-income groups, and the resettled families returned to the inner city (UNCHS, 1984).

Surveys of four West African nations conducted between 1985 and 1988 found that about 80% of respondents over age of 60years were receiving help from children or grandchildren (Kilbride and Kilbride, 1990).

Major lessons drawn from international experiences
  ❖ Local community participation is critical issues before urban renewal program implementation; which means communities needs and aspirations should be the leading goals for any program related to urban renewal and resettlement;
  ❖ Production of affordable development plans that address the urban poor could be achieved by closely working with the community based on what they can afford rather than imposing arbitrary official decisions of standards and procedures;
  ❖ Targeted subsidies may be required to include the poorest residents (like: disable, older people etc.). More holistic urban developments are effective in creating balanced community with cross subsidization mechanisms and with the application of **market driven approach** than simple housing estates of conventional sites and service projects.
  ❖ Gender issues are important; and older women need and demand to be adequately represented;
  ❖ There must be a strong sustained political commitment throughout the lifecycle of the urban renewal/displacement project planning and implementation process;
  ❖ Upgrading renewal projects should aim to reduce poverty by focusing on income generating activities;
  ❖ Security of tenure is a precondition for residents to invest in shelter improvement; moreover scaling up requires appropriate institutions, structures and regulatory frameworks;

- ❖ Upgrading programs are most effective when implanted at the community level through a broad based participation of municipal authorities, community based organizations NGO's, and UN agencies such as UNICEF and Habitat.

2.2. Ethiopian Practice on Urban Displacement (Relocation and Resettlement) Program

For statistical and public administration purposes, however, age of eligibility for retirement (chronological age) is 60 or 65 for Western developed countries (UN, 1991:9) and 60 for some developing countries in Africa including Ethiopia (MOLSA, 1996). As of 2018 Ethiopia does not have a universal old age pension but only pay pension for elderly persons (age 60 and over) who were previously public servants and recently also for private and NGO employee.

Nowadays, the world's population is aging due to improved public health services in both rich and poor countries which results in significant growth of life expectancy at birth. In Ethiopia, according to the 1994 Population and Housing Census, the number of people aged 60 years and above was 2,632,177, of this total 2,307,425 (87.66%) and 324,746 (12.3%) live in rural and urban areas, respectively. The current national census revealed that the size of this population has increased to 3,565,161 elderly people in Ethiopia. This population constitutes 4.82% of the total population of 73,918,505 (CSA, 2008).

In most developed countries, the problem of older people is addressed through institutional care. This support system is functional to a lesser extent in the urban areas of developing countries. However, the support mechanism of older people in most developing countries is embedded in the kinship institution. The situation appears to be the same in Ethiopia too. In Ethiopia especially in rural areas, the family structure is characterized by an extended network of relations. This has been and still is an important source of support in terms of provision of food, shelter, financial, health expenditure, and etc. to elder members[5].

In most traditional or preliterate societies old people are respected, and have high status and role. According to Simmon (Cited in Atchely, 1991), with rapid socio-economic rate of change, older people lose their advantageous status because of the decline of the significance of kinship ties. This trend may be true in some parts of Ethiopia. Evidences have shown that in some parts of Ethiopia, land fragmentation, poverty, rural-urban migration, and the expansion of market forces severely affect old people. Old people face economic hardships, food shortages, chronic diseases, loss of filial piety and veneration (Meseret 1996; Mengesha 1996).

On the other hand, other studies argue that, nowadays, the issue of extended family support for family members, young and old, is coming more and more to the fore as African families are stressed by geographic separation, economic pressures, western

---

[5] IKibreAregawuyanMigbareSenayDirijit (KAMSD); An Assessment of the Situation of Elderly in Addis Ababa; January 2009

influence and forces associated with socio-economic and cultural charges in the 20th century (Cattle, 1990; Kilbride and Kilbride, 1990).

Dr. Emma Helen Banga, (1993); migration, economic and social changes were identified to be the main causes of the breaking-down of the traditional extended family system of care given to the aged in Ghana, especially in a city such as Accra. The basic needs of the aged population according to the study comprise: financial resources, food, home care, companionship, clothing, accommodation, and house repairs. The statement given in conclusion by the study is that, there are failures as well as successes; but it is old people without families, especially the childless, who are suffering most.

In general, it has been evident from studies that in order to design appropriate medical/health – care facilities, social centers, social support systems, that address the range of needs of the elderly, it is helpful for planers to consider at least some socio-economic characteristics of the elderly population.

The assessment of Help Age International (2010) revealed that 11.20% of the elderly people own their own house. Proportionally speaking, more female elderly (14.40%) tend to own private house than male elderly (7.08%) people. Out of those elderly people who reported that they have children, only 9.64% pointed out that their children do visit them. On the contrary, 31.25% of same respondents mentioned that they are not visited by their sons and daughter who live in other places. In addition, 16.67% of the respondents showed that their children are living with them. The findings of the study also show that very few elderly people (4.95%) were visited by their relatives and most of them did not get support from their relatives. The assessment also indicated that 70.57% of the elderly people are members of community based organizations.

According to the results of the study, 33.33% of the elderly people feel that the young generation has a negative view about them. On the other hand, 22.92% and 41.67% of the respondents indicated that they do not perceive young members of the society as having negative attitude toward them or they have no information about the way young people look at them, respectively. Out of those 336 elderly people who indicated to have health problem, the majority (42.19%) said that they use holy water while 30.99% of them go to governmental health care facility (health center). The other 2.34% and 8.59% of the respondents reported that they use traditional medicines or they do not do anything with it, respectively.

For example; most of the time 87.76% of the elderly people indicated that they feel depressed (feeling of sadness). Only 9.90% of the participants of this assessment reported that they have no such kind of feeling. With regard to the feeling of loneliness, 75.78% of the respondents pointed out that they encountered the feeling of loneliness whereas 21.61% of the respondents did not experience the feeling of loneliness.

Out of the 384 elderly under study, only 24 (6.25%) indicated that they are involved in income generating activities at present. When analyzed by sex, it appears that females tended to involve in income generating activities than male elderly. The limited data

available yielded the following types of income generating activities the elderly are engaged in:

- � washing clothes for others,
- �✎ preparing and drying cow dung for firewood,
- ✎ petty trade, as a housemaid,
- ✎ preparing local drinks like *tela (*a kind of beer locally prepared) ,
- ✎ engaging in spinning thread for weaving,
- ✎ Weaving, serving as guard, and Child care.

Older persons living in Ethiopia are challenged in achieving household security as a result of unreliable sources of income, instability in their livelihoods, lack of diversified livelihoods opportunities, and limited access to social and health services. Reliance on a single economic coping strategy did not enable older persons to have a sustainable livelihood [6] .As a result of factors such as increasing urbanization, chronic food insecurity, rising prices and the erosion of traditional coping mechanisms and traditional safety nets; the lifestyles of poor urban older people are dramatically worsening in Ethiopia[7].

The proliferation of slums and squatter settlements in Ethiopia is also the cumulative effect of the wrong policies and strategies followed by successive governments. In the pre-1974 revolution, the major parts of urban land in Ethiopia were owned by few elites, and the large majority of urban citizens were excluded from access to land. This has resulted in overcrowding of residential neighborhoods creating slums (Abraham, 1995).

In Addis Ababa more than 40% of the housing units are owned by Kebeles. These houses have received little maintenance for the last 3 decades. The rent from these houses is too low to cover the maintenance and administration costs. Except the limited experiences in Addis Ababa, nowhere in other urban centers we can find quotable and significant urban renewal/upgrading experiences.

Despite ongoing efforts, current interventions do not provide for adequate and sustainable participation, empowerment, and gender mainstreaming of beneficiaries. The institutional set ups do not initiate partnerships and coordination of efforts by all urban actors.

---

[6]*HealpAge and Coardiad (2011): A study of older people's livelihoods in Ethiopia*
[7]*HelpAge International (2010); the vulnerability and living conditions of older people in Addis Ababa*

3. DOCUMENT REVIEW RESULT ON URBAN RENEWAL, UPGRADING AND DISPLACMENT POLICIES AND PROGRAMS IN ETHIOPIA

The housing situation in Ethiopian cities is a manifestation of the interplay of urbanization, and demographic factors. Over-crowding of dwelling units and mushrooming of squatter settlements, resulted from high rates of population growth and internal migration to urban areas, and scanty rates of housing production, have become distinguishing characteristics of Ethiopian cities. Although the extent of such problems may differ from one urban area to another, the results are basically the same: high densities, sanitation problems, unsafe living conditions, and insecurity of tenure among others (UN-Habitat, 2007).

It has been argued that the rapid growth of slum settlements in Addis Ababa appears to have a number of causes such as the long decay of the inner-city, failed policies and lack of political will and an inability of the poor to access affordable land for housing. On the other hand, poor urban governance, corruption, unresponsive financial systems and the emergence of squatter settlements (UN-Habitat 2007) are some of the challenges where Addis Ababa faces as a prime city. Studies noted during the past decade that the fast deteriorating residential areas have attracted local authorities, NGOs and the wider community to participate in slum upgrading programs.

3.1. Urban Renewal, Relocation and Upgrading Programs/Strategies

Though, the Developmental Social Policy of Ethiopia has clearly pinpointed the need to solve the problems of needy elderly persons (MOLSA, 1996), one may critically question its practical application in the five years of policy implementation period. In the face of the substantive change that has occurred in Ethiopia over the past decades, little is known about the lives of the elderly. The social ties between the elderly and the younger generation and the policy option that should be pursued to help them have not been adequately implemented[8].

The empirical findings demonstrate that although relocated household benefited in terms of an improved quality of new houses, the city upgrading projects have negatively affected these families. Differential quality of housing and increasing costs of rent, income loss, changing schools for children, health problems and loss of savings were experienced. The study concludes that urban redevelopment and resettlement plans need to include the implications of relocation on the lives and livelihood opportunities of poor households.

In Ethiopia thousands of people are experiencing displacement because of urban redevelopment programs. The majority of these people are the urban poor who have

---

[8]KibreAregawuyanMigbareSenayDirijit (KAMSD); An Assessment of the Situation of Elderly in Addis Ababa; January 2009

resided in neglected quarters of urban areas, often in inner city places. The precise number of displaced households by urban redevelopment projects in Addis Ababa remains unknown. However, the social and economic costs for families directly affected by the redevelopment projects are gaining serious concern. Forced evictions and relocations destroy people's traditional lives. They are moved away from their areas of work, their social networks are destroyed and the housing and infrastructure they have built up with their savings are lost (Kalayani 2006).

Addis Ababa City Administration (2007) explains that the program of urban redevelopment aims at achieving an improved living environment for the residents and a better image (beautification) of the city in order to enable an exploitation of its economic potential. Overall, the urban renewal programmes have the twin objectives of promoting urban growth and providing improved housing for the urban poor.

The significant characteristic of Addis Ababa is poor housing conditions, and that the majority of residents are living in slums, commonly known as *Chika bets*, houses made of mud and wood. The majority the houses do not have, sufficient living space and durability of houses, proper services and facilities (CSA 2010). Due to lack of resources for maintenance results in that the houses have a sharp deterioration over time.

The Plan for Urban Development and Urban Good Governance (FDRE 2007) discusses the three pillars of the urban development objectives in Addis Ababa. These are a) micro and small-scale enterprises and job creation; b) integrated housing development and; c) improved access to serviced land and facilities.

Although various strategies have been designed to tackle the housing problem of the city dwellers in general and the urban poor in particular by regimes of the past and the present, which range from initiating low cost housing projects of the Imperial regime, nationalization of urban land and extra houses and formation of housing cooperatives during the time of the military junta-the Dergue ,to condominium projects of the current regime ,the housing problem still remains an unsolved challenge (UN-Habitat, 2007).

Available study results argue that misguided and incoherent organization of policy and planning institutions is one of the prime causes for urban development failures and that the housing and urban (re)development projects should be based on local knowledge and understanding of problems with a view to actively involve local residents and tenants in the planning and management of housing provision and (re)development. As evidenced from some studies, in Ethiopia much less attention has been given to social factors and to housing market factors such as tenure shift and residential and neighborhood change. The housing redevelopment projects, such as the high-rise condominiums are intended to favor middle-income and high-income groups rather than improve original residents' housing welfare[9].

---

[9]TebarekMageneto (January, 2013): Inner City Housing and Urban Development Induced Displacement: Impact on Poor Female-Headed Household in AradaSubcity, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

3.2. Pros and Cons of Urban Displacements for Vulnerable Citizen (Older People)

The city authority of Addis Ababa has currently given increased attention to urban development by replacing poor residential areas with condominium houses and modern apartment complexes. The condominium housing sector has witnessed several changes in terms of improved shelter. However, it is widely observed during the fieldwork that the low purchasing capacity of the city inhabitants posed a serious problem for relocated households. Recent studies indicate that about two-thirds of the city residents depend on home-based businesses and other informal sector activities (Gossaye 2008), thus majority of these residents live at or below the subsistence level (UN-Habitat 2007). This raises the issue of affordability of the housing units, that is, the extent to which households are able to pay for a condominium unit.

Thus, most of the residents informed us that they travel fairly long distances to obtain services such as grinding mills, shops and a daily market. Economically, loss of income, such as home-based small businesses and clients and site-related opportunities, loss of locational advantages, unemployment among the resettled is common because of relocation to relatively remote peri-urban places which are far from established sources of livelihoods. The long distances to former work places typically prohibit travel due to time constraints and additional expenses. The resettlement programs also worsen the separation of communities and increasing the disarticulation of social capital and loss of mutual neighborhood help and inter-personal ties.

Urban renewal program has been exercised without sufficiently understanding the context, scope and meaning of the housing concerns of poor female-headed households and the implications of urban development projects on them[10].

Responses regarding the use of latrine indicated that about 88.2 percent of the sample households in the temporary shelters use shared latrine (dry pit type). At least 12 percent of them use public places such as streets, bushes and streams. For almost half (49.3 percent) of them the toilet facilities are too far from where they sleep. The distant toilet facilities pose a problem for the elderly and patients particularly HIV/AIDS victims who cannot walk far seeking this service[11].

About 97 percent of survey respondents reported that they were networked by *idir*in previous settlement whereas they are denied such social cohesion in current localities because of higher membership fees and distance facto. Another important social capital attribute is *equb, it* is particularly important for the low income groups who suffer serious financial shortages in running business and /or pay for their daily bread. As

---

[10]TebarekMageneto (January, 2013): Inner City Housing and Urban Development Induced Displacement: Impact on Poor Female-Headed Household in AradaSubcity, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
[11]TebarekMageneto (January, 2013): Inner City Housing and Urban Development Induced Displacement: Impact on Poor Female-Headed Household in AradaSubcity, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

survey result revealed, quite a remarkable proportion (78.2 percent) of the respondents participated in *equub*in former settlements. The figure stands as 6.4 percent in the current resettlement site.

The fact that such a higher number of respondents lack previous saving organization in current localities imply that the current housing and urban development schemes appear to be intensifying and deepening poverty among the low income groups and put doubts on the sustainability of the projects. Some jointly shared values such as respect for each other, lending and/or borrowing of money and goods, community participations in various religious and social gatherings could be dismantled by displacement and relocation campaigns.

Low-cost housing condominium apartments are being constructed by the government and offered to urban residents who were living in the areas that are being demolished and who can afford the down-payment and subsequent monthly payments. Some of these condominiums are close to these central areas that are being redeveloped and a larger number are being constructed on the outskirts of the city[12].

The available scant studies suggest; the need to consider a range of options for financing access to condominiums for families who simply cannot afford down-payment and monthly payments if subsidies and support cannot be found. This could include more flexible, longer-term, inter-generational or group loans; the formation of housing cooperatives, possibly linked to *iddir*funeral associations; sponsorship or partial payment from NGOs; donor subsidies; and mobilization of support from the private sector and the Ethiopian diaspora. Other models might include low-cost housing on the outskirts of the city that would be linked to employment opportunities or skills development[13].

The inner city relocates may be divided into four categories: owner occupiers, public tenants (those who lived in public rental houses), subtenants (those who sublet rooms from public tenants), and tenants of private premises. Most owner-occupiers were given land replacement and cash compensation. Subtenants of public houses and tenants of landlords did not qualify for replacement houses or rehabilitation support. The public tenants, the focus of the present study, were given only replacement houses (no rehabilitation assistance). While some of them moved to the site/house of their choices, many were forced to accept smaller spaces and fewer bedrooms, worse locations, and/or higher rental fees[14].

Because of their relocation away from the inner city, most households experienced different hardships, such as decline/loss of income, poor access to educational and health services, transport problems, and breakdown of social networks. Beyond the

---

[12]Young Lifes (2013): ETHIOPIA Urban resettlement brief Moving to Condominium Housing: Views on the Prospect among Children and their Families.

[13]Young Lifes (2013): ETHIOPIA Urban resettlement brief Moving to Condominium Housing: Views on the Prospect among Children and their Families

[14]GebreYntiso (2008): Urban Development and Displacement in Addis Ababa: The Impact of Resettlement Projects on Low-Income Households, Social Science Research in Eastern and Southern Africa.

tenants, subtenants, and owner-occupiers, the urban development programmes affected farm communities in the suburbs, who lost land to investors and new resettlers. Some farmers complained about inadequate compensation and lack of other economic options to make a living. It appears that the recent progress in Addis Ababa has been causing or exacerbating poverty among a section of the population.

The rehabilitation of displaced people goes beyond monetary compensation because it involves replacement of housing, income generating possibilities and locational advantage and disadvantages (Davidson *et al.* 1993).

According to the survey in the five resettlements sites, over 37 per cent of the households reported to have become food insecure due to the relocation. This result is also consistent with Ambaye's (2006) census that showed that 39.7 per cent of the Gurara settlers became food insecure after their relocation. Fitsum (2007) also reported that urban displacement made certain households vulnerable to food insecurity.

The survey shows that in the old villages, 46 per cent of the households paid less than ETB 10.00, about 21 per cent paid between ETB 10.00 and 39.00, and only 7.6 per cent paid over ETB 40.00 per month. In the new settlements, on the contrary, 51.2 per cent paid over ETB 40.00 per month and only 16.5 per cent paid less than that. The monthly minimum and maximum house rent of government-built replacement houses is ETB 45.00 and ETB 99.00 respectively. However, this rule does not apply to the residents of Altad village, who continue to pay the same amount that they used to pay prior to their relocation.

To sum-up, the relocation programs almost in all cases did not benefited the displaced communities as advocated (Arimah 2010). The merits are better quality of houses and better open space for children to play. On the other hand, the process of relocating people from the inner city to new resettlement sites in the outskirts have disrupted the relocatees' business ties with customers, broken their informal networks of survival, caused loss of locational advantage and jobs and incurred high transport costs. The overwhelming majority of relocates reported significant income decline. Many displaced households have encountered problems related to water, sanitation, education, and healthcare. The rent or the payment is not affordable; loseof social solidarity, high cost of transport and services. Farmers, who lost their land to investors and new resettles complained about low compensation and lack of other economic options to make a living[15].

---

[15]GebreYntiso (2008): Urban Development and Displacement in Addis Ababa: The Impact of Resettlement Projects on Low-Income Households, Social Science Research in Eastern and Southern Africa.

4. CASE STORIES OF OLDER PEOPLE ON URBAN DISPLCMENT IN AADIS ABABA

4.1. Displacements Cases of Older People from Arat-Killo to Yeka-Abado

4.1.1. Case Stories Background Information

Two female and one male old people displaced from Arat Kilo area were selected purposefully within an age range between 64-67 years. They have different social, marital, economic and religious background, some have undergraduate degree and few have graduate (Masters) degree and they all have no spouses by separation, divorce and death, but most of them live with their children and together with some relatives like brother and others live with their grandchildren, however almost all of the dependents are either students or they do not have jobs. Pension fund is the major income for the older people however; it is not enough for most of them and fairly enough for some. They prefer to be supported with a free medical coverage and increment of pension money, yet few suggested that it would have been great if job opportunities for older people created. Concerning the health of the older people, their health is not bad and they are in a good health condition.

4.1.2. Causes of Older People Displacements

They discussed with the concerned bodies and their families and reach on consensus before they displaced from the area they used to live. Most of them used to live in government rented house or *Yekebele bet*; yet few of them live in a private house. They consider the major cause of displacement of the older people from their previous residential place is due to the government development plan (urban renewal/upgrading strategy).

4.1.3. Advantage and Disadvantage of the of the Relocation/Resettlement

For all of them the relationship with their families, friends, neighbors and the community at their previous house was very good due to before the displacement as it was tightened with some social activities like "*Idir*", "*Ekub*" and community gatherings but now it is either minimal or non-existent. The living standard and economic situation for all of them is deteriorating from the previous five years due to health condition and weakness related to aging; in addition to these, the condominium living style is not comfortable for most of them.

> *An elderly informant from this group confirms the value of neighborhood relationships by saying: "Lehabtam genzebu ledeha habtu gorebetu newe" (meaning that good neighbours are wealth to poor people). Similarly, other household head mentioned "A neighbour is better than a sibling far off." A woman explains the challenges of leaving a well-acquainted environment: "I do not know how I can adapt to the new place; the situation is being very uphill."*

There are various thoughts concerning the services given to older people in relation to health, sanitation (Hygiene), education and transport coverage when the previous and the current residential area compared. For some, the health coverage given to elderly people in the previous residential area is better even though not very good; however there is none in the current residence, whereas, the sanitation (hygiene) of the current residential is very good for most of them which was very poor in their previous area. There is improved water, education and transport coverage in the current residence than the previous residence for almost all of them. The nearness of the health service center was good in the previous area for some and poor for few of them and not near in the current residence. In the same vein, the road coverage is very good in the current living residence area which was poor in the previous residence. The hygiene or sanitation, the health facilities nearness, road coverage is better in the current residence, whereas, there is no health coverage given to older people in both residences. There is no supporting individual or organization that gives support to older people in their area, home or neighbor and also there no recreational center or places older people hang out in the nearby for free. For most of them have a good relationship with their families, relatives and friends in their previous area which is none in the current area.

The elder people social and economic relationship was improved concerning infrastructure and their relationship for most of them but for a few of them considers that their relationship with their relatives is improved. However, the relationship they have with their neighbors and their surrounding community is not improved, when the current residence compared with the previous living area due to various reasons like: the neighbors did not know with each other, their houses are very far from town and deterioration in the living condition. There is no improvement in terms of income and work relationship and community support to elderly people in their current residential area is almost none. Moreover, due to the displacement all of the elder people gained nice house facilities but they lost their customers as there is minimal income from the market for few and some lost their social and communal relationship.

An elderly women informant in a condominium noted a monthly payment-related frustration:"My children paid me the down-payment for the condominium. My worry now is that we finished the grace period and monthly payment to the bank will start soon. We entered into a loan-agreement with the bank, but to be honest the cost is expensive. This has forced many people who I know to rent out their units to others."

4.2. Displacements Cases of Older People around Sheraton to Yeka-Ayaat

4.2.1. Case Stories Background Information

The three people selected are purposely from the **Sheraton** residential area & there age is above 65 and lost their residential area for development reason by the government without their willing & without reaching any conciseness.

Two of them are women & one man the two women are illiterates and could not complete his primary level education (1-8). Most of them live with their children and

grandchildren and have no job whereas; households like "Bayesh" sons and daughters have work with minimal income. Almost the entire older people livelihood depends on relatives and families income and no pension fee. For all of them their income is very little and almost very hard to live when it is compared with their expenses. All of them prefer to be supported financially (money). They also have health problems and for some the medical expense is also a huge challenge which made their situation worse. They also said that they need adequate nutrition, clothes; healthcare in order to lead a healthful life.

4.2.2. Causes of Older People Displacements

All of the displaced people used to live in <u>Sheraton</u> shelter area; at the time of displacement they discussed with the concerned local government and their families but they are forced to leave without their willingness and conciseness. The three poor helpless and destitute old persons in "Sheraton Area" consider the major cause of displacement from their previous residential place is due to urban renewal need of the government.

4.2.3. Advantage and Disadvantage of the Relocation/Resettlement

In the first place they were not willing to leave their former residential area because they had a very good social relationship with their families, friends, neighbors and the community. Moreover; the living standard and health condition is deteriorating for most of them, in addition the condominium living style is not comfortable for few of them.

> *Similarly, an informant's viewpoint explains the loss of a relationship that was built over years of living together: "We left every social relation there. The previous relations could not emerge here again (or at least it takes a long time). Living in a society who you know well, makes you feel safe and secured."*

Regarding the access and the quality of the service deliver, for some of them the health service access for elderly in the previous residential area is better even though not good in relation to availability of age friendly health practionneres and availability of medicine. The nearness of the health service center was good in the previous area, whereas; the sanitation (hygiene),water, education and transport access of the current residential is very good compared to the previous area.

In both cases (former and current residences) there is no older people friendly health service delivery. There is no supporting individual or organization that gives support to older people in their area, home or neighbor and also there no recreational center or places for older people hang out in the nearby for free.

There is no improvement in terms of income and work relationship and community support to elderly people in their current residential area is almost none. Moreover, due to the displacement all of the elder people gained nice house facilities but they lost their

customers as there is minimal income from the market for few and some lost their social and communal relationship.

> *One respondent stated "the previously I pay only five birr per month but now I pay 45 birr per month for a single room. It is ten times larger than the previous one but the rent is nine times higher. It is expensive for me because I do not have a permanent income. The allotted price does not consider the affordability of the poor."*

4.3. Displacements Cases of Older People from GorfAswegaje (Filwha) to Cherkos Condominium (Summit Area)

4.3.1. Background Information for Case Stories

Three older people purposefully selected from the Filweha Shelter. All of them are women between 62-65 ages with different social, marital, economic and religious status and all of them stopped their education at a primary level. Most of them live with their children and grandchildren and some with other relatives like sister of which most of them do not have job whereas, only few have work with minimal income. Most of the older people income is donation or support from their relatives and families and some of them have pension. Almost for all of them their income is very little and almost very hard to live by it when it is compared with their expenses. All of them prefer to be supported financially (money). They also have health problems and for some the medical expense is also a huge challenge which made their situation worse.

4.3.2. Causes of Older People Displacements

All of the displaced people used to live in Filweha Shelter, GorfAswegajsefer; at the time of displacement they discussed and agreed on it with the concerned bodies and their families. They consider the major cause of displacement of the older people from their previous residential place is due to the government need of the area for development purpose.

4.3.3. Advantage and Disadvantage of the of the Relocation/Resettlement

They had a very good relationship with their families, friends, neighbors and the community before their displacement as it was tightened with some social activities like *Idir*, *Ekub* and community gatherings but now it is either minimal or non-existent. The living standard and economic situation for all of them is deteriorating from the previous 5 years due to health condition and weakness related to aging; in addition to these, the condominium living style is not comfortable for few of them.

> *An old women informant explains: "While the housing situation now is better than the previous house, I prefer to live with my neighbours in the old place in a plastic shelter."*

24

There are various thoughts concerning the services given to older people in relation to health, sanitation (Hygiene), education and transport coverage when the previous and the current residential area compared. For some, the health coverage given to elderly people in the previous residential area is better even though not very good; however there is none in the current residence, whereas, the sanitation (hygiene) of the current residential is very good for most of them which was very poor in their previous area. There is improved water, education and transport coverage in the current residence than the previous residence for almost all of them. The nearness of the health service center was good in the previous area for some and poor for few of them and not near in the current residence. In the same vein, the road coverage is very good in the current living residence area which was poor in the previous residence. The hygiene or sanitation, the health facilities nearness, road coverage is better in the current residence, whereas, there is no health coverage given to older people in both residences. There is no supporting individual or organization that gives support to older people in their area, home or neighbor and also there no recreational center or places older people hang out in the nearby for free. For most of them have a good relationship with their families, relatives and friends in their previous area which is none in the current area.

> *A case study respondent mentioned the health service problem in the new area as follows: "Nowadays some private health-care facilities are found. However, our economic capacity could not allow us to go there to get services. Their expensiveness starts out from taking a card for registration. Hence, we go far to get to a government health centres."*

The elder people social and economic relationship was improved concerning infrastructure and their relationship for most of them but for a few of them considers that their relationship with their relatives is improved. However, the relationship they have with their neighbors and their surrounding community is not improved, when the current residence compared with the previous living area due to various reasons like: the neighbors did not know with each other, their houses are very far from town and deterioration in the living condition. There is no improvement in terms of income and work relationship and community support to elderly people in their current residential area is almost none. Moreover, due to the displacement all of the elder people gained nice house facilities but they lost their customers as there is minimal income from the market for few and some lost their social and communal relationship.

> *In the words of one informant: "Displacement has changed all. I never paid house rent before. I am now paying money for rent. And the new place is not beneficial for my work, I lost my clients."*

4.4. Summary of the Cases: on Older People Knowledge About their Right

There is no awareness concerning the policy devised by the government concerning elderly people right by all of them and most of them never participated in a meeting held by the local government initiatives at any level but few participated in some community gatherings regarding elderly.

All case story respondents believe that the right of older people is not respected at all in most of the following issues like: having sufficient food and nutrition, having free use of health facilities and medical coverage, serving older people first in all service/facilities, providing priority for elderly on transport service, preparing recreation areas and places for older people discussion and experience sharing with their friends, facilitating opportunity of work for older who are educated and productive, establishment of universal pension fund and providing every help that older people needs or giving every support and helping helpless.

During the displacement there is no support given to most of the elderly people but only a few received loans (25,000) for three years from their kebele. Furthermore, the older people do not think that they passed good things to the generation, as a result they do not think a role modeled generation is created and they suggested that some kind of platform needs to be arranged like creating an atmosphere where older people pass or share their knowledge, skill and moral ethics to the new young generations through different institutions like religious institution, media and so on. Some of them also think that creating the platform for older productive people who are on pension to work with younger generation so that transfer of knowledge, attitude and skill will be attained.

4.5. Older Persons Way-forward Based on the Case Histories

During displacement there was no promise made to support female and male elderly people, debilitated and people with disabilities and some of them suggested that for the future giving support for those who have no or minimal income, whereas, some of them suggested that giving full and all round support, care and comfortable housing for weak aging people and destitute people living in a poor living condition.

Local community participation is critical issues before urban renewal program implementation; which means communities needs and aspirations should be the leading goals for any program related to urban renewal and resettlement. All helpless and destitute old aged persons should get proper care, food & cloths, health service and other basic needs by the concerned bodies.Respondents finally suggested that they should enjoy a sound and fulfilling old aged life toward achieving a promising life through their physical, mental, emotional, social and spiritual development and wellbeing.

During displacement there was no promise made to support female and male elderly people, debilitated and people with disabilities. The respondents recommended that while giving displaced people new houses the comfort and safety for older people needs to be maintained, for instance avoiding stairs for older people and placing them on the ground floor is one of the thing suggested by almost all older people. Furthermore, some of them suggested that weaker old people not to be displaced from their areas and to be placed in their nearby constructed house projects. Few of some suggested to put the older people from the same area in to the same surroundings so that the social and communal relationship will not disrupted.

5. CONCLUSIONS AND POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1. Conclusions

The empirical findings demonstrate that although relocated household benefited in terms of an improved quality of new houses, the city upgrading projects have negatively affected these families. Differential quality of housing and increasing costs of rent, income loss, changing schools for children, health problems and loss of savings were experienced. The study concludes that urban redevelopment and resettlement plans need to include the implications of relocation on the lives and livelihood opportunities of poor households.

The city authority of Addis Ababa has currently given increased attention to urban development by replacing poor residential areas with condominium houses and modern apartment complexes. Thus, most of the relocated residents mentioned that they travel fairly long distances to obtain services such as grinding mills, shops and a daily market. Economically, loss of income, such as home-based small businesses and clients and site-related opportunities, loss of locational advantages, unemployment among the resettled is common because of relocation to relatively remote peri-urban places which are far from established sources of livelihoods. The resettlement programs also worsen the separation of communities and increasing the disarticulation of social capital and loss of mutual neighborhood help and inter-personal ties.

The document review result suggest; the need to consider a range of options for financing access to condominiums for families who simply cannot afford down-payment and monthly payments if subsidies and support cannot be found. This could include more flexible, longer-term, inter-generational or group loans; the formation of housing cooperatives, possibly linked to *iddir*funeral associations; sponsorship or partial payment from NGOs; donor subsidies; and mobilization of support from the private sector and the Ethiopian diaspora. Other models might include low-cost housing on the outskirts of the city that would be linked to employment opportunities or skills development.

To sum-up, the available study results argue that misguided and incoherent organization of policy and planning institutions is one of the prime causes for urban development failures and that the housing and urban (re)development projects should be based on local knowledge and understanding of problems with a view to actively involve local residents and tenants in the planning and management of housing provision and (re)development. As evidenced from some studies, in Ethiopia much less attention has been given to social factors and to housing market factors such as tenure shift and residential and neighborhood change. The housing redevelopment projects, such as the high-rise condominiums are intended to favor middle-income and high-income groups rather than improve original residents' housing welfare.

5.2. Lessons from Document Review Relocation and Settlement Programs

- ❖ Local community participation is critical issues before urban renewal program implementation; which means communities needs and aspirations should be the leading goals for any program related to urban renewal and resettlement;
- ❖ Production of affordable development plans that address the urban poor could be achieved by closely working with the community based on what they can afford rather than imposing arbitrary official decisions of standards and procedures;
- ❖ Targeted subsidies may be required to include the poorest residents (like: disable, older people etc.). More holistic urban developments are effective in creating balanced community with cross subsidization mechanisms and with the application of market driven approach than simple housing estates of conventional sites and service projects.
- ❖ Gender issues are important; and older women need and demand to be adequately represented;
- ❖ There must be a strong sustained political commitment throughout the lifecycle of the urban renewal/displacement project planning and implementation process;
- ❖ Upgrading renewal projects should aim to reduce poverty by focusing on income generating activities;
- ❖ Security of tenure is a precondition for residents to invest in shelter improvement; moreover scaling up requires appropriate institutions, structures and regulatory frameworks;
- ❖ Upgrading programs are most effective when implanted at the community level through a broad based participation of municipal authorities, community based organizations NGO's, and UN agencies such as UNICEF and Habitat.

5.3. Recommendations from the Case study

- ❖ Case study respondent suggested during displacement it is important to give support for those who have no or minimal income, whereas, some of them suggested that giving full and all round support, care and comfortable housing for weak aging people and older people living in a poor living condition.
- ❖ During relocation and settlement, elderly should enjoy a sound and fulfilling old aged life toward achieving a promising life through their physical, mental, emotional, social and spiritual development and wellbeing.
- ❖ Case study respondent also recommended that while giving displaced people new houses the comfort and safety for older people needs to be maintained, for instance avoiding stairs for older people and placing them on the ground floor is one of the thing suggested by almost all older people.
- ❖ Furthermore, some of them suggested that weaker old people not to be displaced from their areas and to be placed in their nearby constructed house projects. Few of some suggested to put the older people from the same area in to the same surroundings so that the social and communal relationship will not disrupted.

5.4. Policy Recommendation

❖ This is because the government focused on the physical relocation of residents rather than on involving them in choosing where they would like to be relocated.

❖ The main aim of any resettlement scheme should be seen as restoring the income-generating capacity of resettled people.

❖ Relocation is the recognition of the centrality of home and neighborhood, that is, to the economic and social well-being of families.

❖ Thus, urban redevelopment schemes must combine improved livelihood with both better shelter *and* socioeconomic opportunities and provisions of services and facilities.

❖ Addis Ababa city authority should work with local NGOs, CBOs, donors and residents to ensure that people's preferences are taken into account in resettlement plans.

❖ Many of the problems are manifestations of misguided planning and poor housing and urban development strategies. It appears that there are weak linkages between policy makers, planners, support institutions and the public at large.

❖ The eligibility criteria of meeting the minimum initial payments for condominium houses is vital for social groups like women; older and disabled poor people, therefore it important to revise/amend the affordability of the condominium units, through supporting/subsidizing mechanisms.

❖ One proposed change offers a strict formula for allocating the limited funds to low- and moderate-income housing and rehabilitation in more severely depressed areas.

❖ Given the inevitability of large-scale urban displacements in the future, Ethiopia needs to develop a resettlement policy with clear guidelines and procedures, and involve relevant stakeholders and partners in resettlement operations. It is essential to involve all the stakeholders and partners not only in resettlement policy formulation but also in project planning, design, and implementation.

❖ Loss/decline of income could be averted through interim remedial support programmes, such as cash/food delivery, reduction of house rent, provision of free access to public transport, and exemption from utility bills. Secondly, people could be resettled near viable commercial and/or industrial areas that can serve as an alternative option for generating income and employment.

❖ The distance between the old and the new villages should have be close enough so that the relocated people could easily go to the old villages to work, maintain social networks, and access social services until the new sites are fully developed. Finally, NGOs and the private sector could innovatively be encouraged to participate in urban resettlement rehabilitation.

❖ It is important to support the reestablishment of project affected people as matter of right rather than as a humanitarian act of benevolence.

❖ The right to the city' would basically consist of the right of all city dwellers to fully enjoy urban life with all of its services and advantages – the right to habitation – as well as taking direct part in the management of cities – the right to participation.

6. ANNEXESS

6.1. Term of Reference for the Task

Background

Ethiopian Elderly and Pensioners National Association (EEPNA) are a national umbrella institution of older people Associations in Ethiopia that works for the right and wellbeing of older Women and Men in the Country. A group of visionary Ethiopian older men and women who were dissatisfied with the socio–economic and political marginalization of Ethiopian elderly has initiated the establishment of EEPNA. Accordingly after the strong effort of those older people Advocates, EEPNA was officially established and obtained its legal entity in 2001 to voice for the right and entitlements of all older people in the country.

Since its conception in 2001, EEPNA has played vital role in establishing and strengthening older people Associations all over the country; undertaking sound advocacy, lobby and awareness raising campaigns; organizing policy influencing and dialogue forums; facilitating intergenerational knowledge transferee and multi-generational linkage sessions; initiating research and evidence gathering and creating conducive environment for older people care and support service providers. These days, EEPNA is the only institution of its kind representing grassroots older people associations working for the betterment of the lives of older men and women in Ethiopia. As any Ethiopian citizen celebrated her/his 60 years of age, he/she will be the member of EEPNA by default. EEPNA is also the leading organization that advocate for all marginalized and hard to reach community group through its institutionalized campaigning strategy of *"Leave No One Behind: Promoting a Society for all."* EEPNA has established strong partnership with different Governmental and Non-Governmental Organizations, National Associations and other partners that enabled the association to have ample opportunity of networking and widening its works for older people across Ethiopia.

Context

Today, more than half of the world's population lives in cities, with this proportion set to rise to two-thirds by 2050. The global population is also ageing rapidly, with the numbers of people aged over 60 set to pass the 1 billion mark over the next decade. A significant and growing number of the world's urban residents are older people – more than 500 million. These two trends – urbanization and population ageing – are occurring most rapidly in low- and middle-income countries.

Cities can be dynamic, socially progressive and economically powerful places, bringing many benefits to residents. These include social and cultural diversity, a strong civil society, better public services and greater economic opportunities.

However, urban residents do not enjoy equal access to these benefits. Many people are marginalized and excluded – socially, economically and spatially – particularly in older age, due to ageist attitudes and behavior and the lack of inclusive planning and development decisions. This exclusion is exacerbated during times of humanitarian emergency and response.

Many findings indicate that older persons in cities are too often subject to systematic social, economic and spatial marginalization and exclusion. Traffic-dominated streets and air pollution,

limited public transport, unsafe green spaces, social isolation, insecure incomes, poor health, inaccessible buildings, and insecure or inappropriate housing can all deny older persons their right to lead safe, dignified and independent lives.

To guarantee the human rights of all residents, including older persons, national governments and city authorities must adopt and implement non-discriminatory, inclusive legislation, inter-sectorial policies and emergency preparedness and response plans. Participatory mechanisms that engage with organizations representing older persons must be established to ensure the full and effective participation of older persons in policy and other decision-making processes.

These measures should also take into account the diversity of people's experiences in older age. Our cities must be inclusive of all older people and their intersecting social identities such as ethnic origin, disability, sexual orientation or gender. This is necessary to ensure inclusive urban social, economic and physical environments that protect and promote human rights throughout every stage of people's lives, including in older age.

In Ethiopia mainly Addis Ababa, is undergoing a major transformation and said to be rebuilding as new city as evidenced by the development of road networks, schools, healthcare institutions, hotels, condominiums, real estates, banks, shopping centers, and many other businesses. There is a sense of jubilation on the part of authorities and the general public with the direction of the urban development policy and the remarkable gains scored thus far. What remains unnoticed, however, is that thousands of low-income households and marginalized group such as older people have been displaced and adversely affected by the process of urban development.

The process of relocating people from the inner city to new resettlement sites in the outskirts have disrupted the relocates business ties with customers, broken their informal networks of survival, caused loss of locational advantage and jobs and incurred high transport costs. The overwhelming majority of relocates reported significant income decline. Many displaced households have encountered problems related to water, sanitation, education, and healthcare. Hence most argue that progress in Addis Ababa has been exacerbating poverty among a section of the population including older people.

Need and Objective

Many findings indicate that older people are vulnerable to urban displacement as their needs and priorities are not considered during all this process. Displacement has many impacts on older people among which we have also identified areas of concern of older persons in relation to displacement such as:

- Exclusion and discrimination
- Erosion of family and traditional support systems
- Access to information and documentation
- Access to basic services, including shelter, food and nutrition, Livelihoods and recovery, and health.

Hence the main objective of this research is to identify impact of urban displacement on older people in the area of above listed categories based on case stories of older people and generate policy recommendations for lobby and advocacy purpose.

Consultancy Tasks

Our recent findings from life experience of older people shows that for older people cities present physical, social and economic barriers that prevent them realizing their right to live in dignity and safety, or enjoying their surroundings. Hence the consultant

4) Develop different real case stories from older people themselves displaced due to urban relocation program, infrastructure development and expiation.
5) Review related national policies and strategies related to urban relocation or displacement and how vulnerable group issues addressed. List any article mentioning the elderly needs and priority
6) Develop policy recommendations and program interventions to address the gaps in policy and programming identified during this task. The following issues needs due attention:
   - Accessibility - Physical accessibility of the relocation area to older people
   - Inclusiveness - What makes shared urban spaces and streets truly inclusive and livable?
   - Health - What is the relationship between our health in older age and the physical, social and economic urban environment?
   - Protection from abuse and violence - What makes older people living in cities feel vulnerable to crime or disaster, and how does this affect their daily lives or the assistance they receive in times of crisis?
   - Participation and living standard - Priorities include enabling older people to participate in planning and decision making, to have access to safe and affordable public transport & to enjoy pleasant, safe and accessible green and public spaces.
   - Social value erosion – how older people social relations and values eroded and their access to information narrowed ending with discrimination and loneness which is main cause of dipration.
7) Produce a Policy Analysis Report which would incorporate the findings and policy recommendations and program interventions from the above points.

Timeframe: The timeframe for the consultancy assignment should be one month.

6.2. Case Story Participants List and Background Information

No	Name of Older Persons	Sex	Age	Family Size	Former Residence Area	Current Residence Area	Source of Income
1	Desta Haile	Male	65	3	GorfAswegaj	Ayaat (Cherkos Condominium)	Pension
2	Fetun Mangebash Hailu	Female	63	2	GorfAswegaj	Ayaat (Cherkos Condominium)	Family Support
3	Beletu Alemine	Female	62	3	GorfAswegaj	Ayaat (Cherkos Condominium)	Relative support
4	Etenesh Alem	Female	82	7	Sheraton Area	Yeka (Ayaat)	Family Support
5	Bayush Habtemariam	Female	65	5	Sheraton Area	Yeka (Ayaat)	Family Support
6	Zeleke Teka	Male	65	5	Sheraton Area	Yeka (Ayaat)	Family Support
7	Kasech Damte	Female	61	7	Arat kilo Area	YekaAbado	Pension
8	Gezahegn G/Gihorgis	Male	64	4	Arat kilo Area	YekaAbado	Pension
9	Melkam Alemu	Female	64	3	Arat kilo Area	YekaAbado	Pension

6.3. Detail Questionnaires for the Case Story (Amharic version)

በአዲስ አበባ የከተማ ማሻሻያ መርሀ-ግብሮች ምክንያት ከመኖሪያቸው ለሚነሱ እና ወደ ሌላ ቦታ በሚሰፍሩ አረጋውያን ላይ የሚደርሱ ክስተቶች

ይህ ቃለ መጠየቅ የተዘጋጀው ለከተማው እድገትና ውብት ተብሎ ከመኖሪያ ቤታቸው ለሚነሱና ወደ ሌላ ቦታ ለሚሰፍሩ አረጋውያን ነው፡፡ በሚፈናቀሉበት ወቅት ከ60-65 ዓመት ዕድሜ ለነበራቸው አረጋውያን ብቻ ነው፡፡ ለማስታወስ እንዲቻል ከአምስት ዓመት ያልበለጠ የቅርብ ጊዜ ክስተት ቢሆን ይመረጣል፡፡ ይህ መጠይቅ የተዘጋጀው በቅድሚያ በተመረጡ ሶስት አካባቢዎችና ዘጠኝ አዛውንቶች (ሴቶች እና ወንዶች) ብቻ ነው፡፡

ክፍል አንድ፡-አጠቃላይ የተጠያቂው አረጋዊ የቤተሰብ ሁኔታ

1. የሚጠየቀው አረጋዊ ስም_____ 2. ዖታ_____ 3. ዕድሜ_____
4. የትምህርት ደረጃ_____ 5. የጋብቻ ሁኔታ_____
6. ሀይማኖት_____
7. የተወለዱበት ክልል_____ ልዩመጠሪያስም_____
8. ከአረጋውያኑ ጋር የሚኖሩ ቤተሰቦች/ ዘመዶች ብዛትና ከአረጋውያኑ ጋር ያላቸው ዝምድና

ተ.ቁ	ሙሉ ስም	ዝምድና	የሥራ ሁኔታ
1			
2			
3			
4			
5			
6			
7			

9. የአረጋውያኑ የገቢ ምንጭ ዝርዝር (መልሱ ከአንድ በላይ ሊሆን ይችላል)
   ሀ. የጡረታ ☐   ሐ. በስራ ላይ ☐   ሠ. ከዕርዳታ ☐
   ለ. ከቤተሰብ ☐   መ. ከንደኛ ☐
   ረ. ሌላ ካለ_____
10. በጡረታ ብቻ የሚተዳደሩ ከሆነ
    ሀ. በቂ ነው ☐   ለ. በቂ አይደለም ☐
11. አሁን ያለዎትን ገቢ ለመኖር ከሚያስፈልገው ሁኔታ ጋር እንዴት ይለኩታል
    ሀ. በጣም ጥሩ   ለ. መልካም ነው
    ሐ. ዝቅተኛ ነው   መ. መናገር ያዳግታል (ምንም የለኝም)
12. አሁን በምን መንገድ ቢረዱ በተሻለ መኖር የሚችሉ ይመስልዎታል
    ሀ. የገንዘብ ድጋፍ   ለ. የማቴሪያል ድጋፍ   ሐ. የጡረታ ገቢ ቢሻሻል
    መ. ነፃ ህክምና የመጠለያ   ሠ. የሚንከባከበን ሰው ቢኖር
    ረ. ሌላ ካለ ይግለፁ_____
13. የአረጋውያኑ የጤንነት ሁኔታ በአሁኑ ወቅት ያለው ይግለፅ፡_____

ክፍል ሁለት፡-ከመኖሪያቸው የተነሱበት /የተፈናቀሉበት ምክንያቶች
14. ከአሁን በፊት ከሚኖሩበት ቦታ ሲፈናቀሉ
    ሀ. ከሚመለከተው አካላትና ከቤተሰብዎ ጋር በመስማማት ነው
    ለ. አልተስማማሁም በግዴታ ነው
    ሐ. አላወቅሁም/ አላስታወሰውም
    መ. ሌላ ካለ ይግለፅ፡-_____
15. የተፈናቀሉበት የመኖሪያ ቤት
    ሀ. የግል/የቤተሰብ መኖሪያ
    ለ. የመንግስት ኪራይ/ የቀበሌ
    ሐ. የግል ኪራይ
    መ. ሌላ_____

16. ለመፈናቀልም ወይም የመኖሪያ ቦታዎ ወደ ሌላ አካባቢ እንዲሰፍሩ የተደረገበት ዋና ምክንያት
    ሀ. የርስዎ፣ የቤተሰብዎ የመኖሪያ ቤትናቦታ ለልማት በመፈለጉ
    ለ. አካባቢውን ለማልማት/ለማደስ በመንግስት በመታቀዱ
    ሐ. ምክንያቱ አይታወቅም
    መ. ሌላ ምክንያት ካለው ይግለፁ፦-_____

ክፍል ሶስት፦አረጋውያኑ ከመፈናቀል በፊትና በኋላ ያለባትን ሁኔታ ለማነፃፀር የቀረበ ቃል መጠየቅ፦-

17. ማህበራዊ ግንኙነትን በተመለከተ (ከአካባቢው ነዋሪም ሆነ ከመመድና ከጎደኛ እንዲሁም ከማህረሰብ
    ማህበራት ጋር) ያለውና የነበረውን ግንኙነት ያብራሩ፦-_____
    _____

18. ከአምስት አመት በፊት የነበረው አሁን ያለው የአረጋውያኑ/ የቤተሰብ የኢኮኖሚ ሁኔታ
    ሀ. ተሻሽሏል ☐   ለ. ተዳክሟል ☐
    ለምን/ በምን ምክንያት፦- _____

19. ለአረጋውያኑ ከጤና፣ ከንፅህና፣ ከውሀ አገልግሎት፣ የትምህርት የመንገድ ተደራሽነት አንጻር የአሁኑና
    የበፊቱ እንዴት ነበር?

የመሠረታዊ አገልግሎት ሁኔታ	በመጀመሪያው መኖሪያ የነበረው				አሁን ያለው የመኖሪያ ቤት ሁኔታ			
	በጣም ጥሩ	ደህና	ዝቅተኛ	ምንም የለም	በጣም ጥሩ	ደህና	ዝቅተኛ	ምንም የለም
ለአረጋውያን የሚሰጥ ህክምና								
የንፅህና								
የውሀ አገልግሎት								
የትምህርት አቅርቦት								
የጤና አገልግሎት ቅርበት								
የመንገድ ተደራሽነት								

20. ከቤት /ከጎረቤት አካባቢ አረጋውያንንም ሆነ አቅመ ደካሞችን በግልም ሆነ በድርጅት የሚረዳ፦-
    አለ ☐   የለም ☐

21. አረጋውያንን የሚያግዙ ድርጅቶች ወይም ግለሰቦች ካሉ ምን ምን እርዳታ ያደርጋሉ፦-_____
    _____

22. ሕብረተሰቡም ሆነ አረጋውያን በነፃ የሚጠቀሙበት መዝናኛ/ መናፈሻ በአሁኑ መኖሪያ አካባቢ
    በቅርብ አለ?
    አለ ☐   የለም ☐
    ምን አይነት አገልግሎት ይሰጣሉ?_____

23. እርስዎ ከቤተሰብ ከመመድና ከጎደኛ ጋር ያለዎት ግንኙነት፦-

	ጥሩ	ደህና	የለም
በድሮ ቦታ			
በአሁኑ ቦታ			

24. ቀድሞ በሚኖሩበት ወይም አሁን ባለበት አረጋዊ በመሆንዎ የደረሰብዎ ጥቃት አለ?
    አለ ☐   የለም ☐
    ካለ ይግለፁ፦- _____

25. በማንኛውም ሁኔታ ቀድሞ የነበራችሁንና አሁን ያለበትን በማነፃፀር እንዴት ይገለፁታል?

የአረጋውያኑ ማህበራዊና ኢኮሚያዊ ግንኙነት	ተሻሽሏል	አልተሻሻለም	ምክንያት
የግንኙነት (ከጎረቤት ከሰፈር) ያለው ሁኔታ			
ከስራ ግንኙነት አኳያና ከገቢ ምንጭ			
ከቤተሰብ ጋር ያለው መቀራረብ			
መሠረታዊ አገልግሎቶችን ከማግኘት አንጻር			
ከኑሮ ውድነት አኳያ			
የአካባቢው ማህበረሰብ ለአረጋውያን ያለው			

ድጋፍ/ተዕዕኛ			
ከዘመድ ጋር ያለው ግንኙነት			
ከጎደኛ ጋር ያለው ግንኙነት			
በቦታ ለውጥ ምክንያት ያገኙት	አለ	የለም	ይጠቀስ_____
በቦታ ለውጥ ምክንያት ያጡት	አለ	የለም	ይጠቀስ_____

ክፍል አራት፡-ከፖለቲካ ከፖሊሲ አንፃር

26. መንግስት የነደፋቸው የአረጋውያን ፖሊሲ ምን ያህል ያውቃሉ/ይሃተፋሉ?
27. የአካባቢው የመንግስት አካላት በሚጠፉአቸው ስብሰባዎች ያለዎት ተሳትፎ ምን ይመስላል?
28. የአረጋውያን መብቶች ተከበርዋል ብለው ያምናሉ?_____
29. የአረጋውያን መብቶች ናቸው፤ ሊከበሩ ይገባቸዋል ብለው የሚያምኑበት ምን ምን ናቸው?
30. በተፈጥቀለበት ወቅት ለአረጋውያን በሚል ለርስዎ የተደረገልዎት ድጋፍ ምንድን ነው?
31. አሁን ያለውን አጠቃላይ ሁኔታ ሲገመግሙት አረጋውያን መልካሙን ነገር ለትውልድ አስተላልፈዋል አርኣያ የሚሆን ትውልድ ተፈጥሮአል ብለው ያምናሉ ካልሆነ ምን መደረግ አለበት?

ክፍል አምስት፡-አረጋውያንና አቅመ ደካሞች በሚፈናቀለበት ወቅት የነበረ ድጋፍ? ምንስ መደረግ ነበረበት?

32. በተፈናቀለበት ጊዜ ለአረጋውያን ድጋፍ ለማድረግ የተገባ ቃል ነበረ?

አዎ ☐   የለም ☐

33. በተገባው ቃል መሰረት ለአረጋውያን ሴቶች ወይም ወንዶች ወይም አካል ጉዳተኞች ምን ተደረገ?
34. ለወደፊት በልማት ምክንያት ነዋሪዎች የሚነሱ ከሆነ ለአቅመደካሞችና ለአረጋውያን ምን መደረግ ይኖርበታል?

መረጃ የሰበሰበው ሙሉ ስም፡- _____
መረጃ የተሰበሰበት ክፍለ ከተማ፡- _____ወረዳ፡- _____ ልዩ ስም፡- _____
መረጃ የተሰበሰበት ቀን፡- _____
መረጃ ሰብሳቢው የተጠያቂውን አረጋዊ ቃል ሳያዛባ በመሙላቱ የማረጋገጫ ፊርማ_____